Exploring Promising Practices for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion

in Arts and Culture Nonprofits in Denver, CO

Prepared for the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation

University of Colorado Denver

School of Public Affairs

Christina McClelland

Spring 2019

Dr. Robyn Mobbs
Dr. Jane Hansberry
Gina Ferrari

EXPLORING PROMISING PRACTICES FOR DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION IN ARTS AND CULTURE NONPROFITS IN DENVER, CO

Table of Contents

Appendices

EXPLORING PROMISING PRACTICES FOR DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION IN
ARTS AND CULTURE NONPROFITS IN DENVER, CO

Executive Summary

This project explores promising practices in Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) in arts and

culture nonprofits in Denver. The Bonfils-Stanton Foundation seeks to better understand how

local organizations leading in DEI are implementing such practices, both internally and

externally. This project aims to explore the following research questions:

- What are promising practices of increasing DEI efforts in arts and culture
  nonprofits in Denver?
    - What do arts and culture nonprofits understand DEI to mean?
    - What does addressing DEI successfully in an arts and cultural nonprofit
      look like?
    - How do arts and culture organizations know they are successful in DEI
      work?
- What structures can support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in
  Denver?
    - What challenges exist in addressing DEI in arts and culture nonprofits?

This project offers findings on these two questions via a thorough literature review and

interviews with ten arts and culture leaders selected by the client. First, DEI means organizations

are welcoming, co-creating with communities they are engaging, aware of community, and

considering access. For these organizations, promising DEI practices include: creating a diverse

board and ensuring affiliates match organizational understanding of concepts and practices;

formalizing DEI commitments; staff who represent diverse identities and grasp the importance of

DEI; considering DEI in program development; creating equity values statements; and

approaching the work through internal DEI committees and DEI plans embedded in

organizational plans. They define success through: field, discipline, and audience recognition;

diversifying audiences; building authentic community relationships; and having honest organizational conversations about DEI. Secondly, those interviewed emphasized challenges in: measuring progress; hiring diverse staff; and addressing accessibility. Capacity and time were consistently identified as sector needs and interest in resource-sharing between organizations implementing DEI work was high. Those interviewed agree that DEI work requires willingness to take risks and make mistakes. With these findings, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation has an opportunity to broadly share and encourage DEI promising practices in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver. Recommendations for the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation are offered related to building the field, supporting a diverse workforce, and measuring progress. Finally, study limitations and ideas for future research are discussed.

Introduction

According to the U.S. Census Bureau (2015), by 2044, no single racial or ethnic group will be in the majority in America. With a population of just over 700,000 as of July 2017, Denver represents a city where these trends are already in play (U.S. Census Bureau, n.d.). A recent presentation from the Colorado State Demography Office (2019) showed that, while Denver County's current population as a whole is already more diverse that the state of Colorado and the nation, at 50% white and 50% minority, the youth population under 17 is already majority minority, with those identifying as Hispanic in the majority at 53% (Slide 19). Nationally, however, white populations are overrepresented in attendance and participation in arts and culture (National Endowment for the Arts, 2016, p. 2).

The Denver metropolitan area has a rich and unique cultural environment, partially due to the presence of the Scientific and Cultural Facilities District (SCFD), in existence since 1989. Using funds from a one tenth of one percent sales and use tax, SCFD supports cultural facilities throughout the seven-county metropolitan area, specifically for production, presentation, exhibition, advancement and preservation of visual arts, performing arts, cultural history, natural history, and natural sciences (Scientific and Cultural Facilities District, 2019, para. 1). These funds also make possible free and discounted admission at participating institutions several times a year, known as SCFD Free Days. A study of nationwide arts participation rates conducted by

the National Endowment for the Arts in 2016 found Coloradans had particularly high arts

participation rates, ranking second in the nation for watching movies, visiting art galleries, seeing

plays, or reading books and third in the nation for attending live music, theater, or dance

performances (Wenzel, 2016, para. 2). As Denver's population has grown, so too has interest in

arts and culture. In 2018, the Colorado Business Committee for the Arts (CBCA) reported that

cultural attendance reached 15 million people annually, the metro area's second highest since

CBCA's first economic activity study in 1992. Since that time, CBCA also found that cultural

attendance has increased at nearly twice the pace of Denver metro area population growth

(Colorado Business Committee for the Arts, 2018, p. 2).

Despite the strong attendance and enthusiasm these statistics indicate for arts and culture

locally, the sector still falls short in engaging diverse populations. In 2013, Denver Arts and

Venues, the City and County of Denver's cultural agency, worked with Corona Insights to

conduct a public telephone survey as part of the creation of the city's first cultural plan since

1989 (Denver Arts and Venues, 2019, para. 1). In 2017, the same firm completed a follow-up

survey. Interestingly, comparison of this data revealed that, while in 2017, 89% of residents

agreed with "Arts, Culture and Creativity in Denver Bring communities together," up from 84%

in 2013, good/excellent ratings of the amount of culturally diverse programs in Denver fell from

68 to 54% (Corona Insights, 2018, p.7-13). Further, "Latinos and African-Americans in Denver

are less likely to attend arts and cultural events, are feeling less represented in the cultural scene,

and are more likely to face obstacles such as concerns about parking, a lack of information and

feelings of exclusion at cultural events than whites" (Wenzel, 2017, para. 1).

More specifically, Hispanic/Latinx respondents: were interested in the arts but currently

were not participating as much as they would like; found it more difficult to find arts, culture,

and creativity; had more difficulty finding out about arts, culture, and creativity in Denver; and faced slightly different barriers that prevent them from participating in arts, culture, and creativity more, including lack of parking and information, not feeling welcomed, and not feeling like they were represented in arts, culture, and creativity, both in terms of participation and employment (Corona Insights, 2017, p. 12-13). Corona Insights (2017) also found that African-Americans: were interested in the arts but currently were not participating as much as they would like; found it more difficult to find arts, culture, and creativity; and faced slightly different barriers that prevent them from participating in arts, culture, and creativity more, similar to Hispanic/Latinx identifying populations (p. 14-15). Both Hispanic/Latinx and African-American residents were less likely to believe that the arts had a positive impact on Denver than their peers of other races.

Organization

The client, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation, is the sole private foundation in Colorado chiefly supporting the arts in Denver. According to its website, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation "strategically provides grants and fellowships to advance the arts and inspire creative leadership in Denver" (Bonfils-Stanton Foundation, 2019a). Founded in 1962 by Charles Edwin Stanton, the funds the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation distributes originally came from the sale of Belmar Farms in Lakewood, CO upon the death of his wife, May. The organization distributes over $3 million to arts organizations and nonprofit leaders each year with more than $69 million in charitable contributions throughout its history. Goals include: "Enrich Denver's Cultural Life and Landscape, Cultivate exceptional leaders and change agents, and Operate the Foundation to the highest management and ethical standards" (Bonfils-Stanton Foundation, 2019b). Applications are accepted four times a year and types of grants awarded include general

operating support, project support, capital projects, and Arts in Society, a funding program in

collaboration with Hemera Foundation and Colorado Creative Industries to support social

practice projects in the arts. The organization awarded $3,496,748 in grants in 2018 and

$3,189,607 in 2017 (Bonfils-Stanton Foundation, 2019c). Led by President and CEO Gary

Steuer, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation's Board of Trustees includes: Hal Logan, Michael Bock,

Deborah Jordy, Elaine Mariner, Dr. Nita Mosby Tyler, Denise O'Leary, Maruca Salazar, and

Elaine D. Torres. Gina Ferrari, Director, Grants Program, is the contact for this capstone project.

Given the local challenges outlined in the Introduction, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation is

eager to learn more about how it might best support a more diverse, equitable, and inclusive

landscape of arts and culture nonprofits in Denver. The organization originally supported a

variety of causes but decided to shift its focus specifically to the arts in 2012, as "culture needed

the money, the thinking went, and by targeting one area, the foundation could set itself apart

from its peers and become a real player in the community" (Rinaldi, 2015, para. 2). In 2015, to

serve the cultural community, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation contracted with nationally known

audience development expert Donna Walker-Kuhne to conduct focus groups and meet one on

one with local arts and culture organizations to assess needs and develop strategies related to

engaging and building diverse audiences. Resulting recommendations were shared with the field,

including to: "develop common understanding and language of such terms as diversity and

privilege; improve staff recruitment and development through increased organizational

commitment, support, and capacity for engaging diverse audiences; change organizational

culture by making this work a part of every department and position; develop long term

partnerships to tackle this work together through sharing knowledge and effective strategies; and

embrace diverse communities as part of core audiences beyond demographically diverse

participants already attending on SCFD Free Days," (Steuer, 2015, para. 5). Internally, the

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation has also expanded its board to include more community trustee slots

to add diverse voices from the field and become more intentional in considering equity as part of

funding decisions, including reviewing efforts in accessibility, outreach, and internal processes in

grant applications (Steuer, 2016, para. 7).

<div align="center">Project Purpose</div>

This project seeks to explore promising practices in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion

(DEI) in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver. The Bonfils-Stanton Foundation seeks to better

understand how local organizations leading in DEI are implementing such practices, both

internally and externally. The goal of this research is to generate recommendations to assist the

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation in determining how it might best support these efforts in Denver

through informing the field as well as its own practices of identifying organizations strong in this

area. This project aims to explore the following research questions:

- What are promising practices of increasing DEI efforts in arts and culture nonprofits in
  Denver?
    - What do arts and culture nonprofits understand DEI to mean?
    - What does addressing DEI successfully in an arts and cultural nonprofit look like?
    - How do arts and culture organizations know they are successful in DEI work?
- What structures can support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver?
    - What challenges exist in addressing DEI in arts and culture nonprofits?

<div align="center">Literature Review</div>

The literature review has focused on defining Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI)

work; strategies for addressing DEI in organizations; what efforts have taken place in

communities to understand how DEI work might best be implemented; and gaps and limitations in existing research.

Definition of DEI

Kapila, Hines, and Searby (2016) define diversity as "all the ways in which people differ, encompassing the different characteristics that make one individual or group different from another" (para. 3). These characteristics include race, ethnicity, gender, age, national origin, religion, disability, sexual orientation, socioeconomic status, education, marital status, language, and physical appearance. Kapila et al. (2016) also recognize the intersectionality of diversity, "that individuals affiliate with multiple identities." D5, a five-year coalition to advance diversity, equity and inclusion in philanthropy, defines diversity as focused particularly on greater representation of racial and ethnic groups (Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, Hispanics/Latinos/Latinas, African Americans and blacks, and American Indians and Alaska Natives), LGBT populations, people with disabilities, and women (The Center for Effective Philanthropy, 2018, p. 5). "Equity is the fair treatment, access, opportunity, and advancement for all people, while at the same time striving to identify and eliminate barriers that have prevented the full participation of some groups," while "inclusion is the act of creating environments in which any individual or group can be and feel welcomed, respected, supported, and valued to fully participate" (Kapila et al., 2016, para. 4). Grantmakers in the Arts or GIA (2019), the national association of arts and culture funders in the US, adds that understanding of equity requires an understanding of the root causes of disparities in society and implicit bias and that, "while an inclusive group is by definition diverse, a diverse group isn't always inclusive" (para. 10). Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI, or sometimes called EDI) initiatives seek to promote these concepts within organizations, both internally and externally.

In this vein, several leading member-based associations in arts and culture, not specific to artistic media or discipline, have released statements in recent years promoting DEI. Americans for the Arts (AFTA), a nonprofit advancing the arts in the U.S., released the following statement in 2016, "To support a full creative life for all, Americans for the Arts commits to championing policies and practices of cultural equity that empower a just, inclusive, and equitable nation," accompanied by such acknowledgements as "in the United States, there are systems of power that grant privilege and access unequally such that inequity and injustice result, and that must be continuously addressed and changed; cultural equity is critical to the long-term viability of the arts sector; and everyone deserves equal access to a full, vibrant creative life, which is essential to a healthy and democratic society." AFTA (2016) also defines cultural equity as dismantling discriminatory systems of all forms, many of which touch the pursuit of racial equity (equity specific to race) as well as other forms of inequity.

GIA focuses even more specifically on racial equity, believing progress in this area will have "significant positive impact on challenging other discrimination-based injustices" (Grantmakers in the Arts, 2019, para. 2). GIA also uses the racial and ethnic identifiers African, Latinx, Asian, Arab, and Native American (ALAANA) rather than the phrase "people of color," believing this term "conflates together entire groups of people and as a contrast to white;" other sources reviewed do use people of color when speaking of these groups (Grantmakers in the Arts, n.d., para. 3). The organization released an extensive statement of purpose in 2015, most recently revised in 2019, including inclusion and equity as two of its four guiding principles. As leaders in the arts management field, these statements indicate that addressing DEI has become a best practice for arts and culture nonprofits.

Strategies for Addressing DEI in Organizations

In its Statement of Purpose, GIA (2019) also includes recommendations for action for organizations in DEI, including: establishing a racial equity advisory committee; using regular communications to promote racial equity; advocating research and data collection that accurately represents demographics served by and serving in the organization; providing opportunities for training for board and staff; intentionally considering, selecting, and supporting diverse candidates and candidates who value racial equity for boards and staff; assuring that a racial equity lens informs decisions, programs, and policies; and collaborating with other organizations working toward greater racial equity to provide resources and share best practices.

Delving deeper into one of these recommendations, board commitment to DEI, BoardSource, a leading resource for boards, also has created an in-depth statement of commitment to DEI, as it defines boards as playing "a critical role in creating an organization that prioritizes, supports, and invests in diversity, inclusion, and equity" (BoardSource, 2019, para. 1). Further, Ramirez (2016), in describing the James Irvine Foundation's work in encouraging arts participation among California's diverse and low-income communities, mentions, "maintaining a board representative of your community, with the capacity to help share that community's story, is captured in the spirit of why boards exist in the nonprofit structure" (para. 11). To diversify boards, Koya Leadership Partners (2019) recommends trying new recruiting strategies (such as identifying local and national resources, asking staff, and curating a one-time nominating meeting with communities), bringing on members of color in groups, and adding board members in training, while advising avoiding tokenism by "focusing not just on who you want board members to be but also what you want them to do" (p. 29).

In January 2019, AFTA released a report on their progress as an organization, outlining two years of work since their statement's release. AFTA has expanded and created programs to

promote diversity in the arts workforce in general, as well as in leadership through a Diversity in Arts Leadership internship program, an arts and cultural equity fellowship, and different demographic constituency networks, aiming to support those working in the field through connections with peers, developing communities of practice, and decreasing isolation (Lord, 2019, p. 11). Lord (2019) also outlines conducting research to set benchmarks related to demographics, though the author mentions a lack of measurable goals, suggesting future work will develop "better incremental, measurable and manageable metrics of progress" (p. 15).

In this vein, several organizations serving the overall nonprofit sector have created guides for measuring of DEI progress. Third Sector New England's (2011) *Step-by-Step Guide to Achieving Diversity and Inclusion in the Workplace*, recommends infusing evaluation at the very beginning of this work, as well as engaging a consultant to bring an objective perspective while working with an internal committee (p. 6). Equity in the Center's (2019) *Awake to Woke to Work: Building A Race Equity Culture* presents seven strategic elements, or levers, with accompanying personal beliefs and behaviors, policies and processes, and data to measure stages and rate organizational DEI progress. The levers include: senior leaders, managers, boards of directors, community, learning environment, data and organizational culture. To get started, Equity in the Center recommends establishing a shared vocabulary, identifying race equity champions at the board or senior leader levels, naming race equity work as a strategic imperative, opening a continuous dialogue about race equity work, and reviewing data to get a clear picture of inequities and outcomes gaps both internally and externally (p. 20). However, Mauldin, Kidd, & Ruskin (2016) note that even this last piece can be difficult, as measurement "varies by type of organizations, programs and partnerships involved, as well as by funder mandates and the socioeconomic makeup of target populations, among other factors" (p. 36).

Further, nonprofits may struggle with evaluation in general. Chung and Tran (2015), in conducting *The State of Evaluation in Colorado's Nonprofit Sector*, found overall that evaluation "is one of the least prioritized areas when it comes to allocating organizational resources" and common barriers included "a lack of evaluation-specific staff, limited staff time, and insufficient funding" (p. 2).

In 2018, the League of American Orchestras, a national membership-based organization, completd a DEI planning process including a survey, stakeholder interviews, and focus groups. That same year, the organization released *A Strategic Framework for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion* with a vision, values, approaches, goals and indicators of progress (League of American Orchestras, 2019a). One such key approach is humility, "acknowledging that the answers can be elusive and uncomfortable, but entering into the work of EDI with openness, objectivity, and deep institutional commitment" (p. 6). This work sparked its Catalyst Fund grantmaking initiative, with activities eligible for support including: capacity building through strategic thinking, improving competency through training and peer and group-based learning; creating a DEI plan; performing an organizational DEI audit; and measuring internal progress (League of American Orchestras, 2019b, para. 6). Grantees will also be paired with an experienced EDI practitioner while being supported through cohort-based learning.

Locally, *The Landscape Project*, commissioned by The Denver Foundation (2018), is a study to "establish a baseline of the nonprofit sector's self-assessment of its diversity, inclusiveness, and racial equity work," across all types of nonprofits (p. 3). Overall, "there was broad consensus among participants that racial equity within an organization is linked to the extent to which its staff, leadership, and board reflect the community, as defined by its mission statement" as well as agreement that commitment and consistency are key to long-term change in

organizational culture, including the ability to have difficult conversations about these issues (The Denver Foundation, 2018, p. 11-12). However, results presented divergent narratives between staff of different identities, with one participant stating, "Of everyone there I was the only one of color. That is uncomfortable…Here are all of these folks who don't share the same culture as me, and they're talking about this racial equity" (p. 13). Identified barriers included lack of a diverse staff pipeline and "no simple or broadly agreed measure of racial equity (p. 4).

The study presented several recommendations to address these issues, including creating "common progress measures needed to promote greater unity and coordination between all organizations working toward needed systemic change (p. 18). In addition, to address fears about nonprofit leaders of color having decreased fundraising abilities, creating a dedicated funding stream in collaboration with other funders was put forth (p. 18). Finally, relating to recruiting diverse candidates, looking beyond educational levels to recognize lived experience and transferrable skills of diverse candidates, cultivating growth opportunities and building supportive organizational culture were all recommended practices for nonprofits (p. 18).

Further examining diversity issues in the arts workforce, a report commissioned by the William and Flora Hewett Foundation on arts leadership in California found limited opportunities for early to mid-career leaders advance as Baby Boomers delayed retirement due to such factors as the economic recession and choosing to work longer, combined with very few demographically diverse arts administrators (Ono, 2016, p.8). To address this, Ono recommends supporting individual career pathways to cultivate and retain leaders of color through such activities as establishing and supporting networks for leaders of color (without age restriction) and paid internships and mentorships for future leaders of color (p. 16). Kunreuther and Thomas-Breitfeld (2017) found more similarities than differences in background and preparation between

people of color compared to white respondents from a survey of 4,300 nonprofit staff (p. 1). While this research found people of color aspire to nonprofit leadership more than their white colleagues, they are often frustrated by the stress of being called upon to represent a community; further, "rather than focus on the perceived deficits of potential leaders of color, the sector should concentrate on educating nonprofit decision-makers on the issues of race equity and implicit bias," focusing on organizational culture change, hiring and promotion practices, and systems of support for up and coming leaders of color to address barriers (Kunreuther & Thomas-Breitfeld, 2017, p. 1-4).

Examining DEI in Arts and Culture in Several Cities

Several cities have attempted to take stock of how arts and culture organizations in their communities are approaching DEI work, most taking a quantitative approach. In Calgary, Canada, Calgary Arts Development (2017) conducted an Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion survey of Calgary's arts sector, distributed to 161 nonprofit arts organizations they fund annually. The survey focused on three areas: "processes: equity and diversity policies in place at Calgary arts organizations; programming: the number of activities for and with diverse participants undertaken by Calgary arts organizations; and people: the demographics of the arts sector, including artists, administrators and volunteers" (Calgary Arts Development, 2017, p. i). The survey's purpose was defined as "to provide detailed data necessary to construct a demographic profile of Calgary's arts sector and to understand the extent to which Calgary arts organizations have access to policies and procedures that promote equitable and diverse workplaces" (Calgary Arts Development, 2017, p. i). Key findings included that the arts sector is less than half as ethnically diverse than the population of Calgary, board members and those with higher incomes tend to identify as older and male, and younger sector members showed greater diversity.

In 2016, the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs worked with Ithaka S+R to administer a quantitative survey to nearly 1,000 nonprofit cultural organizations located in New York City to establish a baseline related to diversity. This survey collected demographic data on race/ethnicity, gender, disability, age, job type, and level of seniority, with a few accompanying open-ended questions (NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, 2016, p. 2). The quantitative data indicates the city's cultural workforce does not reflect the racial and ethnic diversity of the city, though, in the last decade, the most diverse group of employees was hired. Notably, among those struggling with diversifying staff, "over 75% cite lack of a viable pipeline of diverse job candidates as a major challenge" and "leadership is less diverse (56% of junior staff are white, compared to 73% of senior staff)" (NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, 2016, p. 3). Only one of the findings came from qualitative data: respondents identified peer-to-peer sharing of successful practices and diversity workshops as services they would value (NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, 2016, p. 4). Out of this report, several opportunities were highlighted, such partnering with educational institutions and organizations to access a more diverse staffing pool.

In Los Angeles, the Los Angeles County Arts Commission administered DataArts' Workforce Demographic survey to staff members, board, volunteers, and independent contractors associated with 386 cultural nonprofits. Study results present a demographic picture of the county: the arts and culture workforce is more homogenous (60% White, non- Hispanic) than the county's population (27% White, non-Hispanic); board members are the least diverse of the workforce cohorts; and younger workforce members are more racially diverse than are older members of the workforce (DataArts, 2017, p. 6). DataArts notes that these findings sparks questions about educational requirements for positions in the arts, given that "only 30% of the population of Los Angeles County aged 25 and over have a bachelor's, graduate, or post-

graduate degrees and 59% of those persons are White non-Hispanic," and recommend exploring possible workforce pipelines with high schools, community colleges, and four-year institutions" (p. 35).

Gaps and Limitations in the Research

The research performed in these cities shares some similarities to the surveys of metro Denver audiences mentioned in the Introduction. However, this aforementioned research has all been quantitative or focused on the nonprofit sector as a whole, leaving an opportunity for qualitative research to more deeply examine successes, challenges, and barriers for implementing DEI efforts in nonprofit arts and culture organizations in a specific city, from the perspective of staff. Cuyler (2017), who has written extensively about the lack of diversity among both arts administrators and arts administration students, points out "the cultural sector needs more research relative to DEI in cultural organizations...how should the sector operationalize this concept to make it more possible to implement in practice?" (para. 6). Mauldin et al. (2016) note the emergence of current research in this area, with limited publications in peer-reviewed journals, saying "interest in the question of diversity, cultural equity, and inclusion in the arts and culture sector has been on the rise in late 2015 and early 2016…proven solutions are difficult to find" (p. 7). In its Cultural Equity policy brief, Createquity (2017) agrees, "And therein lies the rub: the further we delved into the literature around cultural equity, and the more we consulted experts and connected with some of the activists who precede us, the more we came to realize that shared understanding simply doesn't exist." There are many opportunities to explore, "what does/can equity look like within a healthy arts ecosystem?" (Createquity, 2017, para. 21). More specifically, in terms of the scope of this project, what are promising practices of increasing DEI efforts and what structures can support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver?

Methodology

A qualitative study was conducted through semi-structured interviews with 10 arts and culture nonprofit leaders in the Denver area to explore promising DEI practices, supportive structures, and challenges. As Nishishiba, Jones, and Kraner (2014) point out, this type of research design can allow for "a richer description of phenomena of interest than can be accomplished with numbers" (p. 285). Interviews lasted approximately one hour and all occurred in person. In terms of sampling, all interview subjects were selected by the client organization. Bonfils-Stanton Foundation's criteria in selecting these organizations came from knowledge and awareness of organizational practices gleaned from reviewing grant applications, as well as from organizations participation in the Arts and Diversity Taskforce, informed by the work done by Ms. Walker-Kuhne and the client's own equity values (Appendix 1). Further, five out of the ten organizations are led by Livingston Fellows, a program of Bonfils-Stanton Foundation that recognizes exceptional nonprofit leaders with potential for unique and significant local contributions. As leaders of nonprofits in Denver recognized by the client organization as successful in DEI work, these individuals can be considered subject matter experts. The full list of interview subjects and qualitative instrument used for conducting interviews are included as Appendices 2 & 3. The development of the 10 open-ended questions and follow-up probes used in the qualitative instrument and accompanying descriptive data form were guided by the literature review process, as well as Denver-specific data and previous work by the client. As stated by D.W. Turner (2010), "open-endedness allows the participants to contribute as much detailed information as they desire and it also allows the researcher to ask probing questions as a means of follow-up" (p. 756).

Interviews were recorded and transcribed, then analyzed via thematic analysis using inductive reasoning, where "the evaluator reviews the materials and generates organizing categories that adequately summarize the content" (Goodrick & Rogers, 2015, p. 577). Transcripts were read and open coding was conducted, followed by pattern coding and categorizing, including identifying quotes to illustrate categories. Finally, manifest and latent themes were identified by the evaluator. Google Sheets, Google Docs, and Microsoft Word were used to track and distill codes to categories to themes, supported by writing done to elicit connections and emerging relationships between the data and the literature (Goodrick & Rogers, 2015, p. 578). Recommendations have been generated through these analyses, informed by the literature review. As such hermeneutic methods privilege criteria such as trustworthiness, the evaluator strove to meet the five high-level evaluation standards for qualitative data analysis identified by Goodrick & Rogers (2015): utility, accuracy, feasibility, propriety, and accountability (p. 589).

Results

The following results were found, based on themes identified in the data gathered from interviews with representatives from leading arts and culture nonprofits. Below, each research question, with sub-questions, is presented with its corresponding findings.

What are promising practices of increasing DEI efforts in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver?

In terms of the first sub-question, "what do arts and culture nonprofits understand DEI to mean," two themes emerged very strongly from those interviewed: welcoming and co-creating with communities. Arts and culture leaders believed that creating an organization where audiences and participants have a welcoming, comfortable experience indicated a strong grasp of

DEI. Co-creating with communities was defined as building relationships and partnerships with diverse communities through authentic connection over time, including such practices as asking communities for their feedback through dialogue and via long-term engagement. Many expressed that they had changed their organizational approaches to reflect this model; Curious Theatre Company, one of the interviewees, even created a white paper (with the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation's support) on this subject in 2018, *The Loyalty Target*. Those interviewed contrasted these strategies with such examples as presenting a theatre production with a diverse cast and assuming this would automatically lead to diverse audiences attending or trying to engage a specific community to immediately participate in an organization's event.

In terms of audiences, interviewees were familiar with current sector discussions related to issues of national arts audiences lacking diversity, particularly in terms of race and ethnic background as well as socioeconomic status (National Endowment for the Arts, 2016). Locally, some organizations had heard from such communities they needed to become more representative in terms of staff, board and programming to stay relevant. Many of those interviewed also mentioned shifting demographics in Metro Denver, including intensifying issues of limited affordable housing, gentrification, and displacement over the past 5-10 years, which have disproportionately affected communities of color and lower socioeconomic status. As some families have moved from Denver to surrounding counties, such as Adams and Arapahoe due to high costs of living, some organizations were aware of barriers, such as transportation, increasing among those currently underrepresented in arts audiences.

Arts and culture leaders interviewed consistently agreed that definitions of DEI should include access, which they indicated meant ensuring that the needs of people with disabilities were being included in discussions of these topics. Accessibility also came up in terms of gender

identity, particularly considering the needs and being inclusive of those identifying as transgender; gender identity was also discussed as an area where organizations felt they needed to gain greater understanding of how to be inclusive, particularly related to welcoming those with nonbinary identities and transgender audiences. During interviews, some examples of grappling with accessibility included transportation, making equipment accessible to people using a wheelchair or who are blind, and creating a gender inclusive restroom. Interestingly, the definitions from this project are in contrast to how some organizations in the research have defined DEI; many have focused more tightly on racial equity (Americans for the Arts, 2016; Grantmakers in the Arts, 2018; Equity in the Center, 2019). Some interviewees felt that when they heard racial equity emphasized in discussions about DEI that issues of access were being excluded. In addition, there was a sense that the intersectionality of different identities was not receiving as much attention in DEI work.

Several of those interviewed agreed that issues of DEI were integral to the founding of their organizations, such as in response to experiences of discrimination and structural oppression; however, at the time, they were not using the terminology "DEI." All were now aware of DEI being a significant topic in the cultural sector; many noted how, in the past, the focus was just on diversity but that inclusion and equity required moving beyond representation to truly incorporate diverse perspectives into an organization (Kapila et al., 2016; Grantmakers in the Arts, 2018). In addition, more than half of respondents, both those identifying as people of color and not, discussed their understanding of DEI developing from personal experience and emphasized an evolving process of learning and growing in their understanding; as one said, "the deeper you go, you're never going to go back." Several recognized the foundation community as well as Denver Arts and Venues positively for making DEI work a priority locally.

The second sub-question was, "what does addressing DEI successfully in an arts and cultural nonprofits look like?" Selected DEI goal responses are included in Appendix 4. In terms of DEI goal setting and practices related to boards, audience, and staff, interviewees all agreed diversity was important, some even more specifically defining this as reflecting the demographic diversity of the seven county SCFD region. (Ramirez, 2016; Grantmakers in the Arts, 2019; The Denver Foundation, 2018). Half of interviewees noticed more diverse organizational audiences over the past 5-10 years. Half of interviewees also noticed increased diversity in their boards, with almost all remaining interviewees mentioning that this type of shift was in progress; a few mentioned staff diversity was improving or had increased; and volunteer demographic shifts were not mentioned. Several mentioned intentional efforts to increase diversity among boards, staff, and audience while also acknowledging significant changes in the Denver metro area over this period.

To achieve this goal with their boards, some organizations were using demographic quotas, some were considering this strategy, and some did not see the need or did not want to approach the work in this way, focusing more on building and maintaining community relationships. Arts and culture leaders emphasized caution around trying to find a certain number of board members with a particular identity; they did not want to tokenize community members and also needed to ensure particular skillsets were represented in their boards (Koya Leadership Partners, 2019). Interviewees also pointed out that having a diverse board, especially in terms of race, wasn't the same thing as engaging boards in the DEI work they were doing; board commitment to this work was extremely important (BoardSource, 2019; Grantmakers in the Arts, 2019). As boards represent organizations in the community, as do company members, faculty, contractors and others who are affiliated with an organization, but are not necessarily entrenched

in organizational culture the same way staff are, ensuring all of these parties get the same training and have the same discussions emerged as a priority.

The importance of solidifying the commitment of organizations, boards, and leaders to DEI in terms of language was seen as a prominent theme across interviews (The Denver Foundation, 2018). For some, like those who called DEI integral to the formation of their organizations, this is a process of formalizing policy and institutional knowledge. Almost all organizations had developed an equity values statement in some form, either internal or external, which is discussed in greater depth below; those shared are included in Appendix 5. Having a written commitment to DEI integrated throughout the organization and supported by leadership and supervisors who recognize its value was identified by those interviewed as important due to the challenging and ongoing nature of this work (Equity at the Center, 2019; The Denver Foundation, 2018; League of Orchestras, 2019a).

Another major theme across interviews was that arts and culture leaders recognized it was important to have staff of diverse identities represented in their organizations but struggled to find people with these identities to fill both administrative and artistic roles (The Denver Foundation, 2019; Calgary Arts Development, 2017; NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, 2016; DataArts, 2017). Homogeneous perspectives brought by homogeneous staff were identified as a problem. Interview conversations focused on recruiting diverse staff, particularly people of color, with some organizations mentioning that few with these identities applied for their open positions. Many attributed this to limited diversity in the arts and culture sector overall in Denver, though some mentioned that they were currently examining their own hiring practices with an eye toward this issue (The Denver Foundation, 2018). Some larger organizations saw diversity gains in staff but more at lower levels; it remained a challenge at leadership levels,

where people tended to stay in positions for a long time (Ono, 2016; Kunreuther & Thomas-Breitfeld, 2017). Interviewees had less to say about the retention and experiences of staff who identify as people of color; some of those interviewed confirmed research showing people with these identities can be tasked with taking on a significant burden of DEI work and may be re-traumatized as other staff learn basic DEI concepts in their organizations (Kunreuther & Thomas-Breitfeld, 2017; The Denver Foundation, 2018). In terms of current staff understanding the importance of DEI, several arts and culture leaders interviewed mentioned examples including discussions about DEI during staff meetings, sharing and talking about DEI related articles and the presence of questions about DEI implementation as part of performance goals and evaluations. In this vein, those interviewed emphasized the importance of DEI being a focus across an organization, ingrained into staff culture and not compartmentalized within one department (Equity in the Center, 2019, The Denver Foundation, 2018).

During the interviews, arts and culture leaders were probed about the presence of the following list of DEI practices in their organization, informed by the research: an equity values statement; conducting a DEI assessment/data collection; creating a DEI plan; establishing an internal DEI committee; creating a staff position responsible for leading DEI work; considering DEI in terms of programs, fundraising and/or vendors; and/or collaborating and/or sharing information with other organizations. All those interviewed are consistently considering DEI in terms of their programs, with everything from reduced admission for those eligible for SNAP benefits to a GLBTQ family day to decisions made in terms of a season of performances. In addition, they were all involved in and interested in sharing information related to DEI with other organizations. As mentioned above, nearly all organizations had either created an equity values statement or were in the process of creating or considering one (Appendix 5). The majority of

organizations also had formed DEI internal committees, some in partnership with their boards (with both staff and board members), some with several committees of only staff, and some organizations were small enough that DEI topics were discussed as part of regular staff meetings. When asked about organizational DEI plans, many said they included them as part of strategic or master plans; few organizations had them exist alone.

On the subject of having a dedicated staff person related to DEI, few organizations had the capacity for a dedicated role. Often, the work was shared among positions, sometimes including the executive director, or part of community engagement or outreach work; sometimes carving out DEI capacity meant prioritizing it over another organizational need, such as marketing. One organization had a dedicated DEI staff role but found it ineffective due to lack of authority and then opted to share the work among several positions and departments; another started with sharing the work among several positions and departments but was now hiring for one dedicated role to oversee DEI work. Several mentioned the importance of this work not being compartmentalized but rather, infused throughout organizational culture. Few organizations were considering DEI in terms of vendors at this point and over all, little came up in terms of fundraising beyond grant applications including questions about organizational DEI work and donors being mostly supportive.

In terms of the last sub-question, "how do arts and culture organizations know they are successful in DEI work," overall, successes mentioned related to the following themes: receiving positive feedback; being recognized by peers, audiences, funders, and policy makers; and changing organizational culture. Selected responses to this question are included in Appendix 4. Those interviewed consistently identified being recognized positively by audiences and those in their artistic discipline and field, both locally and nationally, as a sign of success. Such indicators

included being invited to do trainings, present at conferences, and create and share documents and tools, as well as receiving a grant for DEI work and being complimented by people encountering the organization internally and externally, such as new staff and long-time audience-members. Arts and culture leaders interviewed also defined success as seeing diversifying audiences, staff, and boards in terms of demographics, though methods of achieving this and intentionality differed among organizations. Building authentic relationships and seeing community partners want to continue and grow their partnerships was also classified as success. Another gauge of success mentioned was the ability to have conversations about diverse experiences and perspectives, particularly relating to race, both for staff and board members (The Denver Foundation, 2018). This success was attributed to the presence of diversity first but also from creating openness in organizational culture so that staff felt comfortable speaking about their experiences and knowing they would be listened to, even if it caused some discomfort.

How organizations measured progress in DEI work was not at all consistent, similar to the research reviewed (The Denver Foundation, 2018; Lord, 2019; Mauldin et al., 2016). Some organizations used strategies such as demographic tracking, surveying audiences and staff on their experiences, performance evaluations, and conducting focus groups to both establish baselines and track change over time, sometimes tied to goals and performance indicators within organizational plans. Others had no formal systems of evaluation. These organizations tended to rely on a mix of what they described as a "gut check" and anecdotal evidence whether if they got it wrong (or very right), they would receive feedback. Some of those interviewed mentioned feeling behind when it came to how to measure DEI progress.

In summary, in answering the first research question of, "what are promising practices of increasing DEI efforts in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver," this study found that, to arts and

culture nonprofits, DEI means organizations are: welcoming, co-creating with the communities they are engaging, aware of community issues such as displacement and gentrification and their effects on marginalized populations, and considering access, more specifically in terms of serving people with disabilities and different gender identities, in terms of programming and facilities. For these organizations, addressing these issues as an organization includes creating a diverse board, which could be accomplished in a variety of ways, and ensuring boards (and others representing the organization to the community) match the organization in terms of their understanding of DEI concepts and practices. Written, solidified and formalized DEI commitments are important. Ideally, staff represent diverse identities but at the present moment, it is difficult to find such candidates for both artistic and administrative roles and staff should understand the importance of DEI. All of those interviewed are considering DEI in their programs and all are interested in information sharing. Almost all organizations in this study have equity values statements and many have internal DEI committees and DEI plans as part of other organizational plans. Few have a staff person solely dedicated to DEI work and few are considering DEI issues in terms of vendors and fundraising. Denver's leading arts and culture organizations in DEI define their success through: field, discipline, and audience recognition; diversifying audiences; building authentic relationships with communities; and having the ability to have honest organizational conversations about diverse experiences and perspectives. At this time, there is no consistency in measuring DEI progress across these organizations.

What structures can support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver?

In discussing challenges existing in addressing DEI, the sub-question for this second research question, those interviewed emphasized challenges in terms of benchmarking and measuring progress; hiring diverse staff, both administrative and artistic, regardless of whether

organization served diverse audiences; and addressing accessibility. These issues have been discussed in more depth as part of findings for the previous research question. Arts and culture leaders interviewed agreed, that though they perceived many in the sector were talking about DEI, few organizations were exemplary in addressing it and much of the talk centered on how to do it better. They also agreed that a "one size fits all" approach to DEI practices in organizations is not likely to be effective.

Those interviewed agreed that the following structures could support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver. Capacity and time were consistently identified as needs within the sector, with funding necessary to move the work forward, especially in terms of evaluation and measurement. Responses were mixed in terms of desiring more resources, toolkits and guidelines. Some expressed that there were enough of these in the sector and the focus now should be implementation; others desired more and looked to conveners such as funders, committees, and member-based organizations to provide these, both from local and national sources. However, interest in sharing resources between organizations implementing DEI work was high. Some mentioned participating in structured learning cohorts, including Impact United through the Mile High United Way and the Cultural Competence Learning Institute, through the Association of Science-Technology Centers, as supportive in implementing DEI practices in their organizations, similar to the League of American Orchestra's Catalyst Fund program. Those interviewed identified a large number of local and national experts in DEI work in arts and culture organizations; a full list is included as Appendix 6. Overall, arts and culture leaders emphasized that DEI work requires boldness, confidence, willingness to take risks and willingness to make mistakes on the part of organizations. Interviewees mentioned seeing some

organizations delay starting because they didn't want to approach DEI in the wrong way, indicating a strong need for supportive structures.

<div align="center">Conclusions</div>

Discussion and Recommendations

The research results offer findings on the two main questions posed in the study, as stated above, with three recommendations for consideration by the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation going forward: building the field, supporting a diverse workforce, and measuring progress. Interestingly, many of these results are in strong alignment with the findings shared by Ms. Walker-Kuhne (Steuer, 2015).

In terms of building the field, with the identification of these promising practices, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation has the opportunity to increase its role as a convener for arts and culture organizations interested in implementing DEI work. While Bonfils-Stanton Foundation is already doing this as part of its Arts and Diversity Task Force, there may be opportunities for growth through establishing networks through settings such as online channels, like a listserv; larger forums and talks, by invitation and open to the public; workshops and cohort-based learning; and tours and site visits with leading organizations. For example, as co-creation and authentic community relationships emerged as a promising practice, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation could host a public forum where Curious Theatre Company presented *The Loyalty Target*. Diving in to this work through such convenings, regardless of form, could help address the worries about making mistakes and hesitancy to get started mentioned during interviews, especially for arts and culture organizations just embarking on DEI practices. Further, taking a group approach, beyond the Arts and Diversity Task Force, could also answer questions in the nonprofit arts and culture sector that emerged around understanding the needs of people with

disabilities, transgender and nonbinary identities, and marginalized groups who are being pushed out of Denver. As some groups are approaching these issues effectively, such as through one dollar admission for families who are SNAP-eligible, the client organization could provide a platform for learning for the whole sector. The Bonfils-Stanton Foundation could also facilitate shared understanding in the field on how to define DEI, whether specific to racial equity or a broader definition. Finally, as many resources were identified from outside the arts field, collaborating with the wider nonprofit community could also produce innovative results; as The Denver Foundation's recent study showed, many organizations are tackling the same issues.

Supporting a diverse workforce has emerged strongly as a major issue in the arts and culture field, both in the literature and project results. The Bonfils-Stanton Foundation has shown great leadership in addressing this area of need through its support of the inaugural cohort of the Arts and Diversity Internship, a paid opportunity underway this summer. Other potential approaches to explore include: collaborating with other organizations, including foundations to support nonprofit leaders of color; encouraging nonprofit arts and culture organizations to examine education requirements in hiring, putting more value in lived experience and transferrable skills; creating constituency networks to build community and decrease isolation, such as an arts administrators of color group; supporting mentorship opportunities, regardless of age; and partnering with educational institutions, such as high schools, community colleges and four-year institutions (The Denver Foundation, 2018; Lord, 2019; Ono, 2016; NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, 2016; DataArts, 2017). As indicated in the literature, hiring diverse staff is only a first step—supportive organizational cultures, versed in understanding race equity and implicit bias, must be cultivated to ensure success, retention, and growth (The Denver Foundation, 2018; Equity at the Center, 2019; Kunreuther & Thomas-Breitfeld, 2017). In

addition, exploring the needs of diverse staff already in place at arts and culture organizations, as well as supporting a leadership pipeline, are opportunities for future research in this area, particularly given the literature and project findings pointed to stress and negative experiences among those with these identities in the sector.

Finally, both the literature review and study results suggest that measuring DEI is extremely challenging for nonprofit organizations in general, beyond the arts and culture field, combined with limited overall evaluation capacity (Mauldin et al., 2016; Chung & Tran, 2015; Lord, 2019). Few self-assessments are available; those that are, such as the one created by Equity at the Center (2019), while valuable, primarily come from fields outside arts and culture and often are not geared toward beginners. Given the complexity of addressing DEI, measuring progress seems to fall behind implementation. To increase capacity for this important component, the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation could explore supporting an evaluator and/or experienced DEI practitioner to provide consultation to organizations, either as a shared contractor or staff member (Third Sector New England, 2011; League of American Orchestras; 2019b). Supporting the creation of common progress measures, perhaps by such an evaluator, could make this even more effective; it would give organizations a starting point that they could customize and it would also make it easier for the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation to measure progress sector-wide (The Denver Foundation, 2018).

Limitations and future research

The researcher is confident in these findings; however, there are several limitations to this project. The sample size for interviewees was small (n=10) and the sampling purposive, rather than random. Further, this research design, with semi-structured interviews conducted and analyzed by one researcher, creates many opportunities for general and confirmation bias.

During the interview process, to ensure accurate understanding and interpretation of interview responses, the researcher conducted sporadic member checks. In addition, the content analyzed in the interviews seems to have reached saturation, as similar themes began appearing again and again (Nishishiba, Jones and Kraner, 2014, p. 289). Conducting additional research, with a larger sample size and multiple researchers, particularly in the analysis phase, could be methods of addressing bias concerns.

A few additional limitations included that, in large organizations, it can be difficult for one person to know the full extent of the scope of DEI work; the researcher also only talked to staff rather than other roles such as board members and volunteers. As interview subjects included those from very small and very large arts and culture nonprofits in Denver, there was a large variance in organization size and discipline, making it difficult to generalize these findings for all such organizations. More information about each organization is included in Appendix 6. Future research might focus more specifically, such as exploring these topics in large organizations only and interviewing multiple people involved in DEI initiatives. Further, in this project, four out of the ten interview subjects identified as people of color and each brought a unique lens in viewing this work compared to their white counterparts. As mentioned, exploring the experience of people of color working in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver could be rich area in which to conduct research that would be useful to the field, particularly given the identified theme of lack of diversity in the Denver arts and culture workforce. Finally, it is important to acknowledge the power dynamic existing in this research: the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation is the sole funder chiefly supporting the arts in Denver and all of the interviewed organizations receive their funding in some form. While interview subjects were assured that their participation (or declining to participate) would have no effect on future funding and the

researcher's impression was that most were very candid in the experiences and thoughts they shared, having a funder behind this study might skew responses. If the client organization seeks to mitigate this as a potential issue, future research could be done in partnership with a more neutral party, such as a university, the City and County of Denver (who is also a funder) or a member organization such as the Colorado Association of Funders or the Colorado Funders for Inclusiveness and Equity.

Despite these limitations, the project successfully answered the identified research questions, meeting the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation's goal of exploring promising practices in increasing DEI efforts and structures that can support progress in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver. As the sector continues to discuss both concepts and implementation of promising practices related to DEI, it is hoped that these findings will help inform the growing body of research available. There are many opportunities to build on this study and examine DEI in arts and culture nonprofits both locally and nationally.

References

Americans for the Arts. (2016). *Statement on Cultural Equity*. Retrieved from

       https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/pdf/2016/about/cultural_equity/A

       FTA_Cultural_Equity.pdf

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation. (2019a). *About Us*. Retrieved from

       https://bonfils-stantonfoundation.org/about-us/

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation. (2019b). *Goals and Approach*. Retrieved from

       https://bonfils-stantonfoundation.org/about-us/goals-and-approach/

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation. (2019c). *Awarded Grants*. Retrieved from

       https://bonfils-stantonfoundation.org/grants/awarded-grants/

BoardSource. (2019). *Diversity, Inclusion, and Equity.* Retrieved from

       https://boardsource.org/research-critical-issues/diversity-equity-inclusion/

Calgary Arts Development. (2018). *Equity, Diversity & Inclusion: A Demographic Profile of Calgary's Arts Sector*. Retrieved from

https://calgaryartsdevelopment.com/announcements/equity-diversity-inclusion/

The Center for Effective Philanthropy. (2018). *Nonprofit Diversity Efforts: Current Practices and the Role of Foundations*. Retrieved from http://research.cep.org/nonprofit-diversity-efforts

Chung, P. & Tran, M. (2015). State of Evaluation in Colorado's Nonprofit Sector. *The Colorado Trust, Colorado Nonprofit Association, & Community Resource Center*. Retrieved from https://www.coloradotrust.org/sites/default/files/state%20of%20evaluation%208-2015%20links.pdf

Colorado Business Committee for the Arts. (2018). *Economic Activity Study of Metro Denver Culture*. Retrieved from http://cbca.org/economic-activity-study/

Colorado State Demography Office. (2019, February 21). *Denver Population and Demographic Trends* [Powerpoint Slides]. Presentation given to Denver Public Library Commission Meeting.

Corona Insights. (2017). *IMAGINE 2020 Public Survey* [Powerpoint Slides]. Retrieved from http://www.artsandvenuesdenver.com/assets/doc/Corona-Insights-IMAGINE2020-Survey-Report-2017-10-19-70eb5132c3.pdf

Corona Insights. (2018). *Public Survey 2017: Changes seen since 2013* [Powerpoint Slides]. Retrieved from http://www.artsandvenuesdenver.com/assets/doc/Corona-Insights-Combined-I2020-Presentation-2017.2018-53624fc254.pdf

Createquity. (2017). *Cultural Equity*. Retrieved from http://createquity.com/2017/10/cultural-equity/

Curious Theatre Company. (2018). *The Loyalty Target*. Retrieved from

    https://www.curioustheatre.org/loyalty-target/

Cuyler, A.C. (2017). Diversity, Equity, & Inclusion (DEI) in the Cultural Sector: What's next?

    CultureWork, 21(3). Retrieved from https://culturework.uoregon.edu/2017/07/03/june-

    2017-vol-21-no-3-diversity-equity-inclusion-dei-in-the-cultural-sector-whats-next-

    antonio-c-cuyler/

DataArts. (2017). *The Demographics of the Arts and Cultural Workforce in Los Angeles County*.

    Retrieved from

    https://www.lacountyarts.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/artsworkforcedemog2017.pdf

Denver Arts and Venues. (2019). *About Imagine 2020.* Retrieved from

    http://www.artsandvenuesdenver.com/about-imagine-2020

The Denver Foundation. (2018). *The Landscape Report*. Retrieved from

    http://floodlight.denverfoundation.org/Portals/0/Uploads/Documents/Landscape%20Proje

    ct%20Report.pdf

Equity in the Center. (2019). Awake to Woke to Work: Building a Race Equity Culture.

    ProInspire. Retrieved from

    https://static1.squarespace.com/static/56b910ccb6aa60c971d5f98a/t/5c7efd03e2c483e87f

    624538/1551826191759/Equity-in-Center-Awake-Woke-Work-2019-final.pdf

Goodrick, D., & Rogers, P.J. (2015). Qualitative Data Analysis. In Newcomer, K.E., Hatry, H.P.,

    & Wholey, J.S. (Ed.), *Handbook of Practical Program*

    Evaluation (4th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Grantmakers in the Arts. (n.d.). *Racial Equity*. Retrieved from

    https://www.giarts.org/arts-funding/racial-equity

Grantmakers in the Arts. (2019, April 11). *Racial Equity in Arts Funding Statement of Purpose and Recommendations for Action*. Retrieved from https://www.giarts.org/racial-equity-arts-philanthropy

Kapila, M., Hines, E., & Searby, M. (2016). Why Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Matter. *Independent Sector*. Retrieved from https://independentsector.org/resource/why-diversity-equity-and-inclusion-matter/

Koya Leadership Partners. (2019). *The Governance Gap: Examining Diversity and Equity on Nonprofit Boards of Directors*. Retrieved from https://koyapartners.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/KOYA_Governance_Gap_Final.pdf

Kunreuther, F. & Thomas-Breitfeld, S. (2017). Race to Lead: Confronting the Nonprofit Racial Leadership Gap. *Building Movement Project*. Retrieved from http://racetolead.org/race-to-lead/

League of American Orchestras. (2019a). *Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion: An Evolving Strategic Framework*. Retrieved from https://americanorchestras.org/images/stories/diversity/EDI_Framework.pdf

League of American Orchestras. (2019b). *The Catalyst Fund.* Retrieved from https://americanorchestras.org/images/stories/Catalyst_Fund/Catalyst_Fund_RFP.pdf

Lord, C. (2019). *Mapping Our Progress toward Cultural Equity: Americans for the Arts' Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Efforts Since the 2016 Adoption of the Statement on Cultural Equity*. Retrieved from https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/Mapping%20Our%20Progress%20toward%20Cultural%20Equity%20FINAL_0.pdf

Mauldin, B., Kidd, S.L., & Ruskin, J. (2016). Cultural Equity and Inclusion Initiative Literature

Review. *Los Angeles County Arts Commission*. Retrieved from

 https://www.lacountyarts.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/ceii_litrev_final.pdf

National Endowment for the Arts. (2016, July). *Arts Data Profile #10: Results from the Annual*

 Arts Basic Survey (2013-2015): Research Brief #4: Gender, Race and Ethnicity, and Age

 of Arts Participants. Retrieved from https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/aabs-

 research-brief-4.pdf

Nishishiba, M., Jones, M., & Kraner, M. (2014). *Research Methods and Statistics for Public and*

 Nonprofit Administrators: A Practical Guide. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

NYC Department of Cultural Affairs. (2016). *Diversity Survey Overview.* Retrieved from

 https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/diversity/downloads/dcla_diversity_survey_overview.pdf

Ono, E. M. (2016). Moving Arts Leadership Forward. *The William and Flora Hewlett*

 Foundation. Retrieved from

 https://www.cciarts.org/_Library/docs/Moving_Arts_Leadership_Forward_2016.pdf

Ramirez, J. (2016). If Your Board Looked Like Your Community. *Medium: New Faces | New*

 Spaces. Retrieved from https://medium.com/new-faces-new-spaces/if-your-board-looked-

 like-your-community-203c878bb0a0.

Rinaldi, R.M. (2015, June 25). Denver's Bonfils-Stanton goes all in for the arts; influence grows.

 The Denver Post. Retrieved from

 https://www.denverpost.com/2015/06/25/denvers-bonfils-stanton-goes-all-in-for-the-arts-

 influence-grows/

Scientific and Cultural Facilities District. (2019). *About SCFD*. Retrieved from

 http://scfd.org/p/about-scfd.html

Steuer, G. (2015, November 5). *Enhancing Arts Engagement with Diverse Communities*.

Bonfils-Stanton Foundation. Retrieved from https://bonfils-

stantonfoundation.org/enhancing-arts-engagement-with-diverse-communities/

Steuer, G. (2016, May 25). Some Thoughts on the Americans for the Arts Statement on Cultural

Equity. *Mile-High Musings on Arts, Culture, Creativity and Philanthropy*. Retrieved

from http://milehighculture.blogspot.com/2016/05/some-thoughts-on-americans-for-

arts.html

Third Sector New England. (2011). *Step-by-Step Guide to Achieving Diversity and Inclusion in

the Workplace*. https://www.tsne.org/sites/default/files/Achieve-Diversity-StepByStep-

Guide.pdf

Turner, D.W. (2010). Qualitative Interview Design: A Practical Guide for Novice Investigators.

The Qualitative Report, 15(3), 754-760. Retrieved from

http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR15-3/qid.pdf

U.S. Census Bureau. (n.d.). *U.S. Census Bureau QuickFacts Denver city, Colorado; Denver

County, Colorado*. Retrieved from

https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/denvercitycolorado,denvercountycolorado/

RHI425217

U.S. Census Bureau. (2015, March 3). *New Census Bureau Report Analyzes U.S. Population

Projections*. Retrieved from https://www.census.gov/newsroom/press-r

eleases/2015/cb15-tps16.html

Wenzel, J. (2016, October 22). Colorado takes top spots in new NEA arts-engagement

study. *The Denver Post.* Retrieved from

https://www.denverpost.com/2016/08/31/colorado-first-arts-participation/

Wenzel, J. (2017, November 14). Diversity, making culture "fun" among challenges of Denver

arts scene revealed by new survey. *The Know.* Retrieved from

https://theknow.denverpost.com/2017/11/14/denver-arts-culture-survey-2017-

diversity/166627/

Appendix 1: Bonfils-Stanton Foundation Equity/Values Statement

We believe that access to the arts, as an appreciator, participant and/or creator, are basic

human rights that should be enjoyed by all those who live in our community. We also believe

that factors like racism, ableism, sexism, gender bias and lack of economic opportunity have

prevented these cultural opportunities from being equally enjoyed by all. These factors have

contributed to lack of equal access to leadership opportunities, within the arts and the entire

nonprofit sector.

We will ensure that we operate in a way that recognizes these inequities, and that we

work to mitigate them. This includes our grantmaking, programmatic activity, and community

engagement. We hope to inspire and cultivate an arts and culture sector that also embraces equity in their work. We recognize that there are significant societal structural issues that are beyond our capacity to change, but with the tools that ARE at our disposal will do all we can to ensure that our cultural community is healthy, artistically vibrant, equitably supported, and serving the full spectrum of our residents.

We also recognize that doing this work requires that we continually be alert to the necessity that our board, staff and vendors reflect the diverse nature of our community, and that our systems and procedures are examined for bias and changed if necessary.

We value open, honest communication with all our constituencies – grantees, potential grantees, Livingston Fellows, funding colleagues, and civic leaders. With grantees we will always strive to have the sort of relationship that, to the best of our ability, is transparent and collaborative, avoiding the pitfalls of the power differential dynamic.

We will operate our organization in a way that fosters collegiality, opportunity, fairness and honesty, in all we do, striving to maximize the potential of all our employees, trustees and team members

Appendix 2: Interviewees

1. Phamaly Theatre Company, Sasha Hutchings, Managing Director; Regan Linton, Artistic Director; Paul Behrhorst, Director of Production

2. RedLine Contemporary Art Center, Louise Martorano, Executive Director

3. Curious Theatre, Katie Maltais, Managing Director

4. Denver Botanic Gardens, Yvonne Garcia Bardwell, Community Relations Manager

5. Cleo Parker Robinson Dance, Malik Robinson, Executive Director

6. Denver Museum of Nature and Science, Andréa Giron Mathern, Director Community Research and Engagement Strategies

7. Art Students League of Denver, Rachel Basye, Executive Director

8. Youth on Record, Jami Duffy, Executive Director

9. Children's Museum of Denver at Marsico Campus, Amy Burt, Vice President of Development and Communications

10. The Newman Center for the Performing Arts at the University of Denver, Kendra Whitlock Ingram, Executive Director

Appendix 3: Interview Instrument

1. Tell me about what DEI (Diversity, Equity and Inclusion) means to you, specifically in terms of arts and culture organizations.

    a. Probe: Where and how did you learn about this concept?

    b. Probe: What practices might be associated with this?

2. In terms of focusing on DEI work in your organization, what or who has motivated or continues to motivate you?

    a. Probe: Have you noticed any shifts in terms of your audience over the last 5-10 years?

    b. Probe: During this time have you noticed shifts in your staff, volunteer and board makeup?

3. What DEI goals do you have for your organization, both internally and externally?

    a. Probe: How does these goals relate to your leadership, governance and board, staff, and volunteers?

    b. Probe: For staff, how are these goals related to recruitment, retention and training?

    c. Probe: How are these goals related to engaging audiences?

    d. Probe: How do your organization's programs relate to these goals?

4. In practice, what does addressing DEI look like specific to your arts and cultural discipline and organization? Tell me about DEI efforts you have implemented.

    a. Probes: Have you…developed an equity values statement; conducted a DEI assessment/data collection; created a DEI plan; established an internal DEI committee; created a staff position responsible for leading DEI work; considered DEI in terms of programs, fundraising, and/or vendors; and/or collaborated and/or shared information with other organizations...

5. How are you measuring progress in this work?

6. What successes have you achieved? How do you define success?

7. What challenges and barriers have you encountered in this work?

8.   What tools, policies and resources would be helpful in DEI implementation in your

organization?

9. Locally, who do you consider experts in this area and who is implementing these practices

effectively?

10.   Is there anything further you'd like to share with me?

Appendix 4: Selected Responses from Interviewees on DEI Goals and Success

Goals

- Concerted effort to bring in younger audiences, create successful programs for teens and

  create shorter, lower cost programs.

- Bring in different types of art, media and faculty to engage new audiences

- Diversify staff, including full-time staff

- Learn more about how to welcome different gender identities, such as through all gender restrooms

- Diversify staff

- Create mentor program for staff from historically marginalized communities to connect with other employees

- Have a staff that resembles the SCFD region, demographically

- Make volunteering more inclusive

- Be intentional and strategic in terms of community partners

- Make physical space more accessible for needs of people with disabilities

- Honor the whole person when they come to work, valuing and allowing them to show up as they are

- Engage the Latino community in Denver through relevant programming

- Expand board skillset

- Provide transportation to engage new audiences

- Work with communities, community-based and advocacy organizations to design programming

- Build on creating signage in English and Spanish by incorporating other languages

- Solicit feedback from diverse groups through surveys and focus groups

- Plan for changing demographics, particularly increasing older adult population

- Engage families moving outside Denver County

- Tell stories of people of different identities through shows

- More racially diverse audience, board, and staff

- Put DEI policies and processes in place

- Evaluate how inclusive experience is with organization, from staff and audience perspectives

- Connect to new communities authentically

- Be recognized as welcoming

- Preserve institutional knowledge

Successes

- Working with performers, staff members, designers, and technicians who are people with disabilities, as well as have other identities

- Former organization members have gone on to change the culture at their new organizations

- Individual impact

- Accolades from the advocacy and social justice community for organization's work

- Audience members saying they feel welcome, had a positive experience and want to come back

- Having conversations about race on the board level

- Being in the minority as a white person at a production presented by the organization

- Hosting robust discussions after shows about race, with different viewpoints represented

- Tripling the number of people identifying as people of color in their audience

- Getting invited to present at conferences about their work and to be part of groups and conversations

- Successfully implementing SNAP admission program, where eligible visitors receive $1 admission; other large cultural organizations exploring implementing similar programs

- Peers and community members tell them they are doing a good job

- Success is doing an event and people show up and want to continue working with us

- Using performance goals as part of performance appraisal system

- Success is doing provocative programming that explores chasms in society and having them be well received

- A new staff member of color commenting on how happy they are to see so much diversity in programming

- Having an equity culture statement

- Increased diversity in applications for residency program

- High rates of retention and diverse makeup of staff, many of whom participated in organizational programming in the past

- Recognition as a "thought leader"

- Hosting a successful LGBTQ family day

- Creating diverse partnerships

- Increasing staff, audience and board diversity

- Seeing a shift in their audience, demographically

- Staff are comfortable speaking up and talking openly about experiences while also holding others accountable

Appendix 5: Organization Profiles

Small Organizations (Under $1 Million Annual Operating Budget)

- Phamaly Theatre Company (2016 990)

- o Managing Director: Sasha Hutchings

- o Employees: 13

- o Volunteers: 180

- o Established 1991

- o 13 voting members of board

- o $753,755 annual operating budget

- o Equity Values Statement: Not yet created

- Youth on Record (2017 990)

  - o Executive Director: Jami Duffy

  - o Employees: 6

  - o Volunteers: 0

  - o Established 2008

  - o 17 voting members of board

  - o $738,761 annual operating budget

  - o Equity Values Statement: NA (internal)

Mid-Sized Organizations $1-10 Million Annual Operating Budget)

- Art Students League of Denver (2017 990)

  - o Executive Director: Rachel Basye

  - o 164 employees

  - o 230 volunteers

  - o Established 1992

  - o 16 voting members of board

- o Cause area: Arts Education/Schools, Arts Service Activities/Organizations, Visual Arts Organizations

- o $1,722,556 million annual operating budget

- o Equity Values Statement: Diversity Strategic Imperative: We are committed to providing open access to the visual arts to everyone who is interested in them. We would like the diversity profile of ASLD to mirror the community in which we live. We will encourage artists of all ages, backgrounds, incomes and experiences to participate in our programming in order to enrich the experiences of all involved. We will reach beyond our main building to make our programs accessible to all through collaboration and partnership.

- Children's Museum of Denver at Marsico Campus (2017 990)

  - o Executive Director: Mike Yankovich

  - o Employees: 154

  - o Volunteers: 957

  - o Established 1974

  - o 19 voting members of board

  - o $6,549,972 annual operating budget

  - o Equity Values Statement: NA

- Cleo Parker Robinson Dance (aka New Dance Theatre; 2016 990)

  - o Executive Director: Malik Robinson

  - o Employees: 22

  - o Volunteers: 200

  - o Established 1970

- o 10 voting members of board

- o $1,106,808 annual operating budget

- o Equity Values Statement: Shared Decision tree Guiding questions: Are we providing inspirational and artistic movement programming? Are we living our philosophy of One Spirit, Many Voices? Are we awakening communities who need us? Are we unlocking the spirit and talents of artists at all levels? Are we building social equity in communities?

- Curious Theatre Company (2017 990)

  - o Managing Director: Katie Maltais

  - o Employees: 88

  - o Volunteers: 99

  - o Established 1998

  - o 14 voting members of board

  - o $1,227,492 annual operating budget

  - o Equity Values Statement: As part of core values, "We fiercely commit to equity, diversity, and inclusion. We are a leader in demonstrating what equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI) looks like in our theatrical community. This manifests as: Producing work that celebrates the vast diversity of our world, providing audiences a window into new cultural experiences; Gender and racial equity among playwrights and artists; Equitable hiring process for artists and administrators; Diverse representation on our Board of Directors; Intolerance of racism, sexism, or marginalization of any kind – in our offices, our boardroom, our rehearsal spaces, our production meetings, and in our audience and talkbacks;

> Demanding that our theatrical community recognize the essential importance of
>
> responsibly producing work that reflects our diverse world.

- The Newman Center for the Performing Arts (provided as part of interview due as part of University of Denver)
  - Executive Director: Kendra Whitlock Ingram
  - Employees: 26
  - Volunteers: 150
  - Established 2002
  - 8 advisory board members
  - $2.5 million annual operating budget
  - Equity Values Statement: Not yet created
- RedLine Contemporary Art Center (aka Redline, 2017 990)
  - Executive Director: Louise Martrano
  - Employees: 12
  - Volunteers: 90
  - Established 2008
  - 16 voting members of board
  - $1,454,927 annual operating budget
  - Equity Values Statement: NA (internal)

Large Organizations ($10-50 Million Annual Operating Budget)

- Denver Botanic Gardens (aka Denver Botanic Garden, Inc; 2016 990)
  - Executive Director: Brian Vogt
  - Employees: 320

- o Volunteers: 2,383

- o Established 1952

- o 39 voting members of board

- o $ 22,929,529 annual operating budget

- Denver Museum of Nature and Science (aka Colorado Museum of Nature History, 2017 990)

  - o Executive Director: George Sparks

  - o Employees: 561

  - o Volunteers: 1,740

  - o Established 1939

  - o 29 voting members of board

  - o $44,979,731 annual operating budget

  - o Equity Values Statement: Inclusivity Statement: Science helps us understand that diversity in our natural world creates strength and nurtures life. We strive to be a diverse and collaborative team – a team of people from different backgrounds, identities and experiences who are open to being inspired, challenged and changed by one another. At all levels of our organization, in every policy, action and decision, we seek to create a workplace that lives our Museum values and to foster opportunity and mutual respect. We realize that we are on a continual journey toward building community, understanding, and belonging. These aspirations are critical to bringing our mission to life.

Appendix 6: Local and National DEI Experts, Identified by Interviewees

Local Experts

- Tony Garcia, Su Teatro

- Denver Museum of Nature and Science

- Dr. Nita Mosby Tyler, The Equity Project

- Curious Theatre Company

- Tariana Navas-Nieves, Denver Arts and Venues

- Chrissy Deal, WESTAF

- Accessible Audience Experiences

    o Denver Center Theatre Company

    o Local Theater Company in Boulder

    o Community College of Aurora

    o Some parts of University of Colorado Boulder

- Downtown Aurora Visual Arts

- Denver Art Museum

- Ally Rexes: Informal happy hour group from large cultural organizations, originally started for GLBT community staff

- Comal/Focus Points

- Children's Museum of Denver

- Denver Public Library

- Kalyn Heffernan

- Access Gallery

- Cleo Parker Robinson Dance

- Servicios de la Raza

- Julie Gonzales, State Senator

- The Center GLBT Community Center of Colorado

- Kebaya Consulting Anti-Oppression Training

- University of Denver, offering training on bias

National Experts

- Carmen Morgan, Art Equity

- Mixed Blood

- Cultural Competence Learning Institute

- Chicago Children's Museum

- Association of Children's Museums

- People's Institute for Survival

  o Anti-Oppression Training

Appendix 7: MPA Core Competencies Supplemental Documentation

Completing this project with the Bonfils-Stanton Foundation offered the opportunity to demonstrate competency in four of five areas that are core tenants of the MPA program. These four areas, as well as how they were informed by coursework, are described below.

To lead and manage in public governance

Conceiving of and completing this project required understanding of the context of public sector work and its role in society, particularly nonprofit arts and culture organizations which are unique in the Denver area due to the support of the Science and Facilities Cultural District. In addition, understanding organizational theory and behavior and theories of leadership also informed the project, specifically in researching nonprofit structures and staffing and leadership models related to DEI. This knowledge was gained through coursework in PUAD 5001, Introduction to Public Administration; PUAD 5002, Organizational Management and Behavior; and PUAD 5006, Public Service Leadership. Further, exploring promising practices in DEI in arts and culture nonprofits in Denver through qualitative methods, particularly in creating the interview instrument, required a thorough understanding of the role of mission, goals, performance indicators, and financial and programmatic resources in these types of organizations. Conducting effective interviews also required a high degree of emotional intelligence, indicative of competency in this area, particularly as some interviewees shared very personal experiences.

To participate in and contribute to the public policy process

Understanding the context and process of policy making at all levels of government was extremely important in ensuring sufficient understanding of the chosen topic and that the appropriate literature was reviewed. Further, the history of structural and systemic oppression, directly created through policy, and effects on racial equity were critical to grasp in exploring this topic. Recommendations for the client organization generated by project results were informed by coursework completed in PUAD 5005, The Policy Process and Democracy. In this vein, application of techniques for generating and selecting among policy alternatives, identification of barriers to implementation and how they might be overcome, and comprehension of the intersection of policy and administrative processes all were key in developing results and conclusions for this project.

To analyze, synthesize, think critically, solve problems and make decisions.

Thorough understanding of this competency was critical to the conception and completion of this project, including selecting the appropriate research design and methods to achieve project goals and critically assessing and selecting relevant research to be included in the literature review. Collecting and analyzing data to conducting this project also demonstrated competency in this area. Finally, consideration of different perspectives, understanding of decision-making processes, and awareness of ethics were critical in successfully conducting the interviews with arts and culture leaders. Skills and knowledge gained from participation in PUAD 5003, Research and Analytic Methods; PUAD 5008, Evidence-Based Decision-Making; and PUAD 5350, Program Evaluation provided an integral foundation.

To communicate and interact productively with a diverse and changing workforce and citizenry

This project, in meeting both client and course goals, adds to scholarship concerning the value of supporting diverse backgrounds and viewpoints in the public sector, particularly as the literature

review indicated there was a dearth of research exploring this topic. The resulting findings have been communicated effectively in writing, via visual presentations, and in a spoken format. By expressing recommendations in a variety of formats, the client may share this project across Denver's arts and culture nonprofit landscape, such as with its Arts and Diversity Task Force, encouraging adoption of promising practices. Knowledge and understanding gained in the following courses were utilized in project execution: PUAD 5001, Introduction to Public Administration; PUAD 5002, Organizational Management and Behavior; PUAD 5006, Public Service Leadership; and PUAD 5380, Citizen Participation Theory and Practice.